

The Men Desiring to Heal, the Woman Wishing to Be Healed and the Oscillating Gender Politics—On *The Portrait of a Lady* (癒したい男たちと癒されたい女, 浮遊するジェンダーポリティクス)

Satoko NISHIDA

Introduction

In the ending scene of Henry James's *The Portrait of a Lady* (1881), many critics have variously argued on the point why Isabel Archer returns to Rome where her futile marriage life is waiting. This problem is highly connected with Isabel's personal morality as Henry James writes in his "Preface" to this novel that "there is, I think, no more nutritive or suggestive truth in this connexion than that of the perfect dependence of the "moral" sense of a work of art on the amount of felt life concerned in producing it." (James, 45) Isabel is generally recognized as a young woman who hopes to be free and to have high but abstract ideals and who is very eager for knowledge while she dreams her brilliant future. On the other hand, she is sometimes criticized as an arrogant person who is too confident of herself. However, it is not her confidence but her high moral sense and responsibility that takes Isabel back to Rome even if she has the possibility of choice to abandon her marriage life with Gilbert Osmond.

Isabel's sense of responsibility leads her to help her stepdaughter, Pansy, and to fulfill her first choice of marrying Osmond—this is considered as a general interpretation for Isabel's last decision in the ending scene. Isabel completely wishes to decide things by herself. She, therefore, gives an impression that she takes the trouble to suffer by selecting a severer way of life by giving up the chance of happiness, which is close to her. For instance, when she just came to England without any substantial experience and without knowing what the actual hardship is, she showed a haughty dream as if she longed for a predicament as follows:

Her life should always be in harmony with the most pleasing impression she should produce; she would be what she appeared, and she would appear

what she was. Sometimes she went so far as to wish that she might find herself some day in a difficult position, so that she should have the pleasure of being as heroic as the occasion demanded. (51)

Isabel regards the marriage to Lord Warburton as a restriction by the traditional social system embodied by him. She rejects his proposal because she wants to be “free” from such a system. Of course, Lord Warburton, who esteems Isabel’s hope and tries to make Isabel happier, does not understand why the marriage has a possibility of depriving Isabel of freedom. However, for Isabel, Lord Warburton is at first an embodiment of the European social codes and of the conventional restriction, regardless of his own good-natured character. Therefore, by rejecting the marriage to Lord Warburton, she avoids the “gender role” as a wife of an English nobleman or as a woman in the society.

Then, what does Isabel become after avoiding the gender role as a woman? As a single girl, Isabel can be a “neutral” young person as well as be a rather manly person who dreams to go around the wide world by herself. When Isabel is likely to have a gender role suitable for a single young man, she only thinks about how to select and explore her way of life all by herself and need not seek a guardian who protect her from sufferings of lives. Usually a guardian as such is immediately needed for a single young woman at that time. Isabel, therefore, need not obey the rule, which is expected to the gender role of young women, to be “chosen” by a good suitor. She is free because she neither hopes to be given something by others nor tries hard to please them. However, even if Isabel freely shows the high ideal to live on her own, she is never free from the “gender” problem. On the contrary, her Emersonian ideal suggests her potential desire to “be healed” by something concrete.

Her inner self is weaker than any other male characters who are attracted by her. So she tries to hold self-confident spirit to cover her uneasy identity as a single woman in a foreign country. In traditional ways of argument, Isabel, in her maidenhood, is often considered as an independent woman who never wants to rely on someone or something. But deep in her self, there lies a desire for a certain identity on which she can rely. In this sense, she is weaker than any other male characters in this novel and plays the female gender role, which embodies a desire to be healed by strong sense of values to get rid of her uneasiness.

By arguing Isabel's gender problem, it becomes clearer that this novel can imply the close relation between the gender and the nationality, because the idea which Isabel conceives is consistent with the "young" and "developing" American spirit in the same age. On the point that the title of this novel itself represents Isabel's gender problem, Denis Flannery points out as follows:

From its title and from its first page, James's novel makes the relationship between artistic representation and gender a very open question. *The Portrait of a Lady* promises to be just a portrait with the implication that it will be that of not just a specific lady—Isabel Archer—but possibly the embodiment of an ideal. (Flannery, 41)

Such phrases as "American Adam" and "self made men" give us an impression that America has the male gender role; however, Isabel brings out the aspect of the female gender in America in this novel. Is the gender of America male or female? For solving this problem, we need to consider the relative role of America in an international situation at that time. Especially, American uneasy identity in the world and its zeal for having a unique ideal to rely on might be considered as an aspect of the female gender. On the other hand, Casper Goodwood, an active businessman who comes from America pursuing Isabel, represents one of the American male-like aspects. What he embodies is material growth of America and, at the same time, the male gender role of America. However, Isabel who embodies the American spirit in this novel rejects Goodwood. As the title of the novel, "The Portrait of a Lady", suggests, this is a story of the female gender and the female gender role of America is a primary issue. So the meanings of the American spiritual assets, which are embodied by Isabel, depend on the definition of "femaleness". Here, I would like to suppose that Isabel's desperate desire for an identity to rely on and her search for a unique sense of value to escape from the paternal European doctrine are glimpses of the female gender role of America.

Therefore, what the female gender role of America means is not just the weakness but the desire for autonomous sense of values to establish independent national "culture". Such American longings for ideals are both weak and strong points of the female gender role of America. Although America grows rapidly in the material aspect at that time, its shallow culture is always an inferiority

complex for America.

However, American cultural complex in the world makes America the country characterized by self-confident ideals or transcendentalism. Adeline R. Tintner argues, "Isabel is shown... as a woman trapped by her own ideas. Her cultivation of a highly developed sense of beauty and her collection of impressions of art works produce a 'house of suffocation' rather than a house of life." (Tintner, 115) Many ideals embodied by Isabel, which are themselves different from real lives or real power of the country, become the American identity opponent to the European paternal culture, which suggests the male gender role.

I Apollonian Dreaming Self Desiring for Being Healed

This novel can be divided in two parts. That is, the scene of Isabel's maidenhood where she is described as a girl who just comes to Europe from America, wears positive images, while the scene after her marriage wears negative images. In the former positive scene, all those bright and vivid English landscapes and characters around Isabel emphasize her intelligence, sensibility and possibility in her bright future. All things or people are objects which promising Isabel is going to "choose". The contrast between Isabel and other men is clear. Those men as Goodwood, Warburton and even Ralph, who are attracted by Isabel, embody some kinds of restriction, which are entirely different from Isabel's freedom. Each of the men tries to help Isabel to realize her dream and to make her happy. In this sense, the men around Isabel construct a "homosocial" bond, sharing admirable Isabel. And this homosocial bond brings out Isabel's gender different from other characters'. While the men represent restriction, steadiness and heaviness, Isabel represents freedom, instability and brightness. Such Isabel's nature is a little different from that of a person who has the female gender role at that time.

She seems to live like a young man or to have the neutral gender. However, it is Isabel's charm that makes the men construct a homosocial bond and propose to Isabel. As a result, their proposal demands Isabel to play the role of a wife. Therefore, however neutral Isabel herself is, she never gets rid of a female gender role in the men's homosocial bond.

However, Isabel, who is not conscious of her fateful gender role, is eager to absorb various knowledge and has lofty ideals to be a brave and intelligent person, as if a young artist who wishes to cultivate one's sensibility in the land of fertile culture. But Isabel does not commit herself on any occupation. So it is not clear that for what purpose her talent is used. Anyway she believes her noble ideal and hates base character and narrow-mindedness. Both her artistic sensibility and zeal for an ideal suggest "Apollonian" impulse in Nietzscheism. According to Nietzsche, Apollonian impulse makes dreaming conditions, while Dionysos impulse makes intoxicated conditions. As Apollonian artistic impulse produces "inner illusion" or "beautiful dreaming impulse," Isabel's ideal is also her inner dreaming world without her actual experiences. Apollonian ideal entails coolness with which one looks down others and haughty pride, and lacks humanity though it is rational. Isabel thinks such an Apollonian ideal as the mean to support her identity. So she keeps unnatural and unrealistic distance from those men who love her and does not allow herself to sink into them.

After she gets great fortune from her uncle, she seeks the situation in which she and her fortune can be useful for some noble aims, and in which her bravery can be shown. Under the pressure of seeking such situation, she hopes to be "healed." Although the men who love Isabel always want to "heal" her, their needs don't meet between Isabel and the men. That is, Isabel's desire to be healed is only fulfilled by her own service to "heal" someone who is worthy of being helped. Dorothea Krook expresses such Isabel's impulse as the "desire to serve." (Krook, 44) In a sense, Isabel is very proud because she becomes satisfied not with being helped but with helping someone who is grateful to her. She wants to be at a standpoint where she can "give" someone something or can "heal" someone. Such her desire not to be helped but to help someone paradoxically reveals her narrow-mindedness and unrealistic vision for life.

Desiring to be "healed," Isabel rejects Lord Warburton and Goodwood, both of whom want to "heal" her, to meet Gilbert Osmond who seems to be worth of her service. Osmond is originally an American dilettante who lives in Europe for a long time. Osmond's ex-lover, Madame Merle, is also an American. She is very sophisticated in Europe. Those people who are called "cosmopolitans" like Osmond and Madame Merle seem to have relation to Isabel's gender problem.

To be a cosmopolitan seems to have an image of having wide vision for life. At the same time, a cosmopolitan cannot belong anywhere and is an unstable expatriate. To Isabel, Osmond seems to be “a man who has borne his poverty with such dignity, with such indifference” (347). A man who has concrete inner world and is never influenced by outer world is an ideal person for Isabel to serve. What Isabel sees in Osmond’s way of life is itself her ideal. That is, what Isabel longs for is not relative self in a society but an absolute personal sense of value. As for gender, it is also relative concept with male and female. Isabel wants to be a neutral person who chooses her future positively and avoids being a girl just waiting for men’s proposal because she does not like relative existence or concept.

But she does not experience the loneliness as an expatriate trying to hold independent identity in the world. In other words, she is not aware of the pain of the life without gender roles. As for the concept of “loneliness,” she shows her opinion when she and Ralph talk about the ghost as follows:

Ralph shook his head sadly. ‘I might show it to you, but you’d never see it. The privilege isn’t given to everyone; it’s not enviable. It has never been seen by a young, happy, innocent person like you. You must have suffered first, have suffered greatly, have gained some miserable knowledge. In that way your eyes are opened to it. I saw it long ago,’ said Ralph. (48)

According to Ralph, one cannot see the ghost without experiencing the evil, the pain and the ugliness under the appearance of things. Their conversation reveals Isabel’s shallow understandings for the negative elements in life. Because of her gender role as a young female, Isabel is loved by the men who eagerly try to “heal” her. Besides, Madame Merle becomes on friendly terms with Isabel because Isabel is expected to marry someone in the future. That is, what saves Isabel from loneliness and makes the human relation around her is her gender. Moreover, it is not the neutral aspect of Isabel but her female gender that enables her desire to be “healed” by healing someone as her life mission. Although Isabel dislikes English social systems and tries to be free, she is completely ruled by the code of gender. She can become an expatriate from America; however, she cannot become an expatriate from gender. So we can see

that her female gender role is fading when she truly experiences the loneliness and the pain in life.

In her maidenhood, Isabel is bright and full of life even if her ideal in life is ambiguous. And all the misfortunes are outside her. She can heal others by her brightness. Those people who represent some kinds of restrictions or the gloomy past in life bring out Isabel's life as "positive" by showing "negative" elements in life. At the same time, the positive aspect of Isabel's gender role is emphasized in the former part of this novel. With a female gender role, Isabel is more endowed with a lot of choices in life than the people with male gender roles are. That is, she could get some position in England by marrying an English nobleman and could go around the world freely like young men without getting married. Such Isabel's female gender role in the former part of the novel is promising because the negative aspect of her gender is revealed only by an actual painful experience. The role of the male gender is to "seduce" Isabel into a trap by trying to "heal" her. But Isabel chooses to fall into a trap by herself and her desire to be always at the standpoint where she herself can choose things. And it is only after her marriage that she really knows the hardship of the female gender role.

II The Full Picture of the Gender Roles

Then we would like to consider the meanings of the gender role for Isabel after she becomes a wife of a Europeanized American and abandons the standpoint where she can "choose" anything. Isabel explains the reason why she abandoned her freedom and married Osmond in the conversation with Ralph as follows:

'You must have changed immensely. A year ago you valued your liberty beyond everything. You wanted only to see life.'

'I've seen it,' said Isabel. 'It doesn't look to me now, I admit, such an inviting expanse.'

'I don't pretend it is; only I had an idea that you took a genial view of it and wanted to survey the whole field.'

'I've seen that one can't do anything so general. One must choose a corner and cultivate that.' (341)

When Isabel actually chooses the thing to live for, life is not just an object to observe but the matter she herself must construct. However, just after her marriage, she is disappointed with Osmond. Contrary to Isabel's ideal, he is far from a man who is indifferent to worldly success or fame. Osmond is the embodiment of vanity and worldly desires. According to James Duban, "Osmond ultimately reveals himself to be a slave to society" (Duban, 173). As soon as her desire to be "healed" by her healing someone is realized, she loses the object which is worth "healing." Now that she already "chooses" a person to live for and is disappointed with him and cannot completely play the role of a mother for her stepdaughter, Pansy, Isabel's female gender role cannot make her happy. Indeed her female gender role gave her happy illusion in her maidenhood; however, it now restricts her inner freedom and deprives her vividness. The gloomy image of Isabel's marriage represents the negative aspect of a female gender role.

Firstly, with her marriage, Isabel loses a male gender role to act freely. Secondly, she cannot be "healed" by healing a man who deserves to love and loses her female gender role, too. That is, Isabel's gender role comes to be very ambiguous. She is shut out from the gender role and becomes so-called an expatriate from gender. Therefore, she experiences loneliness of losing gender roles for the first time. She has neither mannish nor womanish happiness to be suffocating herself in her life. But the pain and the loneliness, which Isabel experiences in the life with Osmond, bring her a new kind of insight. That is, she gets the perception to recognize the essence of human beings including her. She thinks of the difference between her arrogant ex-ideal and her reality as follows:

Instead of leading to the high places of happiness, from which the world would seem to lie below one, so that one could look down with a sense of exaltation and advantage, and judge and choose and pity, it led rather downward and earthward, into realms of restriction and depression where the sound of other live, easier and freer, was heard as from above, and where it served to deepen the feeling of failure. (425)

She knows that once she had a lot of possibility and now she failed to "choose" things to live for as a result. The remarkable point is that she accepts her failure whose roots lie in her self-confidence. The reason why she rejected good suitors

and chose the life as a person with neutral gender was her self-insistence not to accept the relativity of gender in the society. At that time, the most important issue for Isabel is to believe the existence of absolute “self,” an individual in transcendentalism. In her actual experience, she becomes to be able to see “relative” self objectively. Besides, she has an opportunity to choose her mission again in another phase of her insight for life, which is entirely different from the insight in her maidenhood. Her hardships give her the power to create new meanings of gender roles by herself. The function of “suffering” for Isabel is described as follows:

Suffering, with Isabel, was an active condition; it was not a chill, a stupor, a despair; it was a passion of thought, of speculation, of response to every pressure. (425)

Tony Tanner argues the meaning of Isabel’s misjudgment as follows: “For it is only through choice and commitment that we can find out what we are. In this sense error is also discovery” (Tanner, 150).

In the last scene, Isabel chooses to return to Osmond even if she can choose to abandon him. And this is an act of creating a new meaning of female gender role by Isabel. She restores her identity by holding a gender role as a stepmother for Pansy and by “healing” Pansy who deserves to Isabel’s help. According to Millicent Bell, “marriage is the act which will unite her to the social world and give her role” (Bell, 87). With her marriage experience, she gets the chance to think about her gender role in the society.

Indeed Isabel is disappointed with the life with Osmond and loses the positive aspect of a female gender role. However, there is another reason outside her why she comes to be a metaphorical expatriate or a Diaspora from gender. That is, those men who once longed for Isabel lost their homosocial bond as suitors. Each man loses the male gender role to “heal” Isabel after her marriage. Then Isabel also loses the female gender role, the standpoint to be healed by the men. After experiencing hardships in life and losing empty ideals, she is able to understand the pain of those men whom she once rejected now that she know her arrogance in her maidenhood.

Firstly, for instance, Osmond can only hate Isabel because he is not loved or respected by her. However, Isabel never hates Osmond. Certainly she knows

that Osmond and his ex-lover, Madame Merle, made use of Isabel and Osmond married Isabel for money. But she also feels that she herself concealed her real self-assertive personality and deceived Osmond because she wanted to attract his attention. As for mutual deceiving between Isabel and Osmond because of their lack of mutual cultural backgrounds, Oscar Cargill points out as follows: "James has ironically married fearful opposites—Isabel represents the ultimate of American idealism of her time and Osmond the ultimate of European orthodoxy in the same day. They are incompatible from the start, each deceived about the other because neither had any experience with the type of person the other was" (Cargill, 88). In a sense, Isabel is aware that she, in her way, also deceives Osmond.

Secondly, she feels Ralph's visit to her as a light in her gloomy life, though she didn't deeply think about his advice to her when she was in Gardencourt. When she knows Ralph cannot live long, she conceives gentle feelings, which she has never experienced before toward him. She can sense Ralph's intelligence to perceive Osmond's wickedness now.

Thirdly, she knows that Lord Warburton still remains single because he cannot forget Isabel. He proposes to Pansy, Isabel's stepdaughter, to approach Isabel. Knowing his feelings as such, Isabel must encourage Lord Warburton to marry Pansy at Osmond's request. In her dilemma, Isabel suffers from a guilty feeling that she might be insincere both to Lord Warburton and Pansy.

Fourthly, as for vigorous American Goodwood, Isabel comes to be able to sense the fact that it is she who made him unhappy though she never falls in love with him even after she was disappointed with Osmond.

In this way, Isabel is inclined to be at the standpoint where she "heals" those men who lose the role to heal Isabel and become unhappy. We can see it was just Isabel's desire to heal someone in her maidenhood. Her desire might seem to be realized in this point. However, now that she knows the hardships in life, she wants to heal them not out of presumptuous idealistic feelings but out of natural feelings her growing intelligence bears. As Lord Warburton describes Isabel as Pansy's "guardian angel," (480) Isabel is restoring her female gender role as a mother, keeping up with the change of her circumstances.

Then, we would like to consider how her female gender role to heal a man who

deserves her service changes. Receiving words that Ralph is at his death, Isabel wishes to return to Gardencourt, though Osmond who hates Ralph opposes to her plan. Isabel seriously feels the evident spiritual gulf between her and Osmond, and is sure of the cold-heartedness and the vulgarity of Osmond. But at the same time, she realizes the meaning of marriage bonds in the society at that time as follows:

Marriage meant that in such a case as this, when one had to choose, one chose as a matter of course for one's husband. (540)

Marriage in the social codes means the complete obedience of a wife to her husband and the agreement of a sense of values between a husband and a wife. If Isabel is willing to break the codes, she loses a female gender role as a wife at that time of a society. Besides, when Isabel ignores Osmond's opposition to her returning to Gardencourt and loses the identity as a wife, she hears about the real relation between Osmond and Madame Merle and their trap to make use of Isabel from Countess Gemini. So it seems a suitable choice that Isabel no longer returns to Rome, the home with Osmond, though she never abandons her marriage life.

In Gardencourt, she is proposed to by Goodwood again. Although the marriage to Goodwood is still out of question for Isabel, she restores her instinct and passion to be at a standpoint where she herself can "choose" things freely, thanks to Goodwood, who gives her a gender role as a single young woman to select her life. Isabel is awakened to the power to oppose Goodwood's forcible desire to "heal" her with his best energy and comes to be at a standpoint to select or reject a man.

In this scene of the novel, we can read the process of Isabel's producing new meanings of a female gender role in her society not to lose her brightness while taking the responsibility of her onetime choice. That is, Isabel creates new way of a male and a female gender roles and of marriage. For Isabel, a husband and a wife are not one in body and mind. As independent human beings, they have different sense of values and therefore can know the meaning of loneliness. With Isabel's new recognition for marriage, the loneliness of human beings as social existences with gender is brought out.

III Gender in the American Nationality Circumstances

As a result, Isabel chooses her way of life and takes the responsibility of her deed whenever she is positive or negative. Indeed she feels she was too self-confident in her maidenhood; however, what she can believe is only her sensibility and instinct to “choose” things in the ending scene, too. Certainly she admits her onetime thought that Osmond is a generous cosmopolitan. But she finds her identity to carry out her original choice of life even if it was misjudgment. What she wants is not a person whom she can rely on but a mission to make use of herself. Alwyn Berland also writes, “She has something like a sense of vocation, and her sudden unexpected fortune only increases this sense. Her wealth is a call, not to pleasure, but to duty—or, more precisely, to both, since her highest pleasure lies in seeing her highest duty” (Berland, 98). Isabel’s pride with which she needs to be “healed” by her healing someone also means her strong sense of mission and moral sense. As an embodiment of American transcendentalism, Isabel represents American identity and gender role in the world.

When this novel was written, the idea of transcendentalism was already a onetime ideal in the past. So Isabel’s uneasy identity implies the American uneasiness as a nation without knowing what to believe or where to develop. Catherine Tumber also writes, “The ethic of democratic sociability, along with the economy that nurtured it, had been ravaged by the Civil War and the sordidness of Reconstruction politics” (Tumber, 78). With Isabel, we can think of the American historic identity in the gender circumstances. This does not mean the problem whether America is a male or a female. According to Kouichi Takeda, if the concept of gender helps women be freed from “female-like” deed, it must help men be freed from “male-like” deed, too. When Isabel accepts her gender role as a free woman, she creates new meanings of marriage and a wife. She also deconstructs the cultural relationship between Europe and America like a husband and an obedient wife. Isabel represents the American spirit to establish unique culture different from the traditional European culture, though she also knows the defect of American transcendentalism. Shizue Uchida writes that Isabel knows there are neither absolute precept nor transcended existence in the world (Uchida, 131). So the only means to judge things for Isabel is her own

sensibility even if she is inexperienced.

Isabel's desire to search someone of great value represents the American consciousness to obey the European patriarchal culture and the female gender role of America to want some great ideals to rely on. But America has a destiny to create an independent culture and a role in the world without obeying the European sense of values.

What Isabel embodies as a woman is an aspect of the loneliness of America as an "outsider" in the world. Besides, the fact that Isabel is a "woman" itself makes her an outsider from the English society at that time. This fact is also described in one of James's middle work, "The Spoils of Poynton" (1897). In this novel, a woman named Mrs Gereth is urged to part with her house, Poynton, which is filled with precious antiques she collected. According to English law system, when her husband dies and her son has a wife, she loses the right to live in her house. In this society, women are no existence by law. Those men who wants to "heal" Isabel have certain steadiness and identity, both of which she does not have. So Isabel is an outsider from their homosocial bond. And it is because she is an outsider that she can take an objective view and "choose" things. Isabel's point of view as such may suggests the American standpoint to choose valuable culture from Europe and to create new and independent national culture. Isabel has an oscillating gender role upon the society where she lives because she is an expatriate as well as a woman. Although she has a danger to be exploited by others in the old world, she challenges to go into further Europe with the possibility of creating new gender roles in future.

Note

- (1) Henry James, *The Portrait of a Lady* (Baltimore: Penguin books Inc., 1968) 51. All the quotations from the novel refer to this edition; hereafter, all page references will be noted in parentheses after the quotation.

Works Cited

- Bell, Millicent. *Meaning in Henry James*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1991.
- Berland, Alwyn. *Culture and Conduct in the Novels of Henry James*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univer-

- sity Press, 1981.
- Cargill, Oscar. *The Novels of Henry James*. New York: Hafner Publishing Company, Inc., 1961.
- Duban, James. *The Nature of True Virtue*. London: Associated University Press, 2001.
- Flannery, Denis. *Henry James: A Certain Illusion*. Berlington, Vermont: Ashgate, 2000.
- James, Henry. *The Art of the Novel*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1962.
- . *The Portrait of a Lady*. Baltimore: Penguin Books Inc., 1968.
- . *The Spoils of Poynton*. Hamondsworth: Penguin Books Inc., 1987.
- Krook, Dorothea. *The Ordeal of Consciousness in Henry James*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1967.
- Tambling, Jeremy. *Henry James*. New York: Macmillan Press LTD, 2000.
- Tanner, Tony. *Henry James: Modern Judgements*. Bristol: Macmillan, 1968.
- Tintner, Adeline R. *The Twentieth-Century World of Henry James*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2000.
- Tumber, Catherine. *American Feminism and the Birth of New Age Spirituality*. Lanham: Roman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2002.
- ガヤトリ・C・スピヴァック「文化としての他者」鈴木 聡・大野雅子・鶴飼信光・片岡 信訳（紀伊国屋書店 2001）
- 武田悠一編「ジェンダーは越えられるか：新しい文学批評に向けて」（彩流社 2000）
- 吉見俊哉編「カルチュラル・スタディーズ」（講談社 2001）
- C.G.ユング「タイプ論」林 道義訳（みすず書房 2001）